

SACH

South Asian Composite Heritage

ISSUE NO. 53 ■ JANUARY-MARCH, 2019

Composite Heritage: Building Peace in South Asia

South Asia is one of the most complex regions in the world in terms of ethnic, religious, linguistic and cultural diversity and divisions. The region is characterized by both cross-border cultural and ethnic contiguity, and intraborder diversity. The shared history and culture of the region represent the multiplicity or multiculturalism inherent in the South Asian states which emerged after a long drawn battle against the colonial rule. Conflict is an inevitable feature of societies, but may be more common within communities that encompass diverse cultural identities and economic disparities. In the case of South Asia, conflicts have evolved differently. According to experts on South Asian affairs, conflicts in the region are often precipitated and nurtured by the internal political turbulence, socio-cultural fault-lines and developmental distortions. Many of these have their roots in the region's colonial past, and in the manner in which independence was attained. In the contemporary times, there has been an increasing trend to use history highly selectively to legitimize social discrimination, social hegemony and political supremacy by vested interests contending for power. The past or history is transformed into a weapon to target those considered as "Others". For instance, in India Babri Masjid (Mosque) is one such example of contradicted meaning of past legitimizing its destruction. The falsification of history with imagined identities have subsequently led to the development of exclusionist nationalism and issues like caste, religion, language, gender and race became the very basis of any political discourse. Ethno-cultural and ethno-religious ethos in the post-colonial era led to a slow but sure erosion of democratic and liberal value systems. The process of marginalization, underdevelopment, poverty and discrimination in the socio-economic spheres have increasingly emerged as a factors behind much of the internal and external conflicts in the South Asia region which in turn impacted the prospects for peace and security. It is against this backdrop, composite heritage of South Asia assumes immense significance from the view point of building peace and evolving means to resolve conflict in the region. Composite heritage approach relies on innovative people oriented training methods and knowledge base on local perspectives to popularize social and cultural resources for the purpose of reconciliation and build secular and democratic values underlying the shared traditions intrinsic to the South Asian society and culture. Besides preparing a knowledge base, the approach also focuses on children, women or socially or economically poor and other groups affected by a conflict trying to seek justice and rebuilding their lives. The approach helps to present the past from multiple perspectives which can be used to challenge the so-called national narratives to make it more inclusive instead of exclusive. Composite heritage approach works both on a geographical as well as a social and cultural level to find "other voices" that might have been silenced within the national narrative with the passage of history. Existing flexible social and cultural identities specific to South Asian society can help in bridging the distances between people across the region instead of increasing them. Composite heritage as a peace building tool helps in promoting the idea or the philosophy that despite religious, ethnic and cultural differences, there are more aspects that unites human beings and helps in building a culture of acceptance a sense of shared human identity.

A Queerification

By **REGIE CABICO**, UNITED STATES of AMERICA

queer me
shift me
transgress me
tell my students i'm gay
tell chick fila i'm queer
tell the new york times i'm straight
tell the mail man i'm a lesbian
tell american airlines
i don't know what my gender is
like me
liking you
like summer blockbuster armrest dates
armrest cinematic love
elbow to forearm in the dark
humor me queerly
fill me with laughter
make me high with queer gas
decompress me from centuries of spanish inquisition
& self-righteous judgment
like the blood my blood
that has mixed with the colonizer
& the colonized
in the extinct & instinct to love
bust memories of water & heat
& hot & breath
beating skin on skin fluttering
bruise me into vapors
bleed me into air
fly me over sub-saharan africa & asia & antarctica
explode me from the closet of my fears
graffiti me out of doubt
bend me like bamboo
propose to me
divorce me
divide me into your spirit 2 spirit half spirit
& shadow me with fluttering tongues

& caresses beyond head
heart chakras
fist smashing djembes
between my hesitations
haiku me into 17 bursts of blossoms & cold saki
de-ethnicize me
de-clothe me
de-gender me in brassieres
& prosthetic genitalias
burn me on a brazier
wearing a brassiere
in bitch braggadocio soprano bass
magnificat me in vespers
of hallelujah & amen
libate me in halos
heal me in halls of femmy troubadors
announcing my hiv status
or your status
i am not afraid to love you
implant dialects as if they were lilacs
in my ear
medicate me with a lick & a like
i am not afraid to love you
so demand me
reclaim me
queerify me

*Regie Cabico's is the Youth Program Coordinator
for Split this Rock Poetry.*

courtesy : <https://m.poets.org/poetsorg>

India and Pakistan : Why Peace Building is Difficult?

By **BABITA NEGI**, ISD, INDIA



THE historical relationship between India and Pakistan of now can be traced long back when these boundaries and identities were not even in existence. But actual visible events which describes their relationship and struggles with each other has always been discussed from the era when India and the new state of Pakistan granted Independence in 1947. For the last seventy years, India and Pakistan have been locked into various conflicts but territorial conflict over Kashmir between these two countries is intractable. Till date, due to all the regional and religious tensions, both countries have maintained a bickering relationship that doesn't allow them to build up a passage for peace. Though after the attack on Parliament in 2001, with certain areas of interests, countries have made various attempts to reach on an agreement and make progress in having peace but nothing has been materialized. One of the recent efforts which India and Pakistan have made to reduce the distance of boundaries and countries is Kartarpur Corridor.

KARTARPUR CORRIDOR

During the Partition, it was not only just Hindu or Muslims who were struggling but followers of Sikhism were also in trouble. When Sikh chose their sides of the country they got isolated from their holy

shrines. Gurudwara Darbar Sahib at Kartarpur which is some 140 km from Lahore in Pakistan's is one of them, a memorial to Guru Nanak the founder of the Sikh faith. Kartarpur Corridor is a passage which will allow the Sikh community of India to visit this shrine.

India and Pakistan already have a protocol on a visit to religious shrine 1974 that allows their citizens to visit religious shrines with certain conditions but most of the time whenever there is a tension, both the countries become reluctant to issue Visas to pilgrimage creating further bitterness and mistrust. Therefore the recent initiative of building Kartarpur Corridor kindled massive hope for Indian people in general and Sikh community in particular. It represented a great example of co-operation between two countries. After a huge political row, India and Pakistan agreed to construct the corridor on their respective sides and it is likely to build in time for Guru Nanak's 550th birth anniversary in 2019.

This initiative had shown that citizens and the government are looking for a pathway towards peace. This proposal has also raised hope for bilateral relation, which was on halt since 2001. However, Pakistan's remarks on sensitive internal issues, terrorism and Kashmir conflict and suspicion by the intelligence bureau over the proposal doesn't allow them to see this initiative in terms of making dialogues.

The initiative was already very fragile on top of that it got junked by the recent Pulwama attack in Kashmir followed by the surgical strike 2 and retaliation of Pakistan. Every effort made by the government of both countries went into drain due terrorist attack said to be made by Jaish-E-Mohammad of Pakistan. The recent attacks and the war-like situation have shown that it is very difficult to make peace without a strong political will between these two countries. The series of incidents that has happened in India especially in the last five years has shown that despite making efforts for peace building nothing has been resolved and both India and Pakistan have developed more conflicts.

OTHER EFFORTS FOR PEACE NEGOTIATIONS AFTER 2001

It was January 2004, when former Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee visited Islamabad for the SAARC Summit. It was the first ever channel where both countries met for the dialogue process after the 2001 Parliament. In this meeting, President Musharraf reassured Prime Minister Vajpayee that he will not permit any territory under Pakistan's control to be used to support terrorism in any manner. But after July 2006 local train bombings in Mumbai, the dialogue phase got freeze. In September 2006, in Cuba NAM (Non-Alignment Summit), India and Pakistan come up with the new innovative idea called a Joint Anti-Terrorism Mechanism (JATM). But they started blaming each other for existing situation, reaching nowhere close to what the idea intended for. The peace dialogue picked up steam again during November 2008 when after Mumbai attack for the first time the involvement and evidence of Pakistan-based Lashkar-e-Taiba were exposed but again the two sides remain conflicted, unable to

resume dialogue.

INVITATIONS FOR DIALOGUES 2014-15

After 7 years in 2014, Prime Minister Narendra Modi invited Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif to his swearing and he himself visited Sharif in Lahore in December 2015 for comprehensive dialogue but the proposal and effort became useless. The attack on military bases in Pathankot and Uri and the subsequent surgical strikes by India strained the already unstable relationship. Therefore it is very difficult to say whether any of the strategies can assist these countries in seeking solutions for decade-old dispute.

CONCLUSION

Kartarpur corridor initiated with small goodwill was supposed to ease the pressure on both the countries; it was an opportunity for peace and bilateral dialogues but recent incidents again has shown that despite all efforts the initiative has been derailed. There are evidences which shows that how and in which circumstance this incidence happened but none of the countries took the responsibility of violence and conflict and blamed each other. It's not just terrorism and religious or regional conflict which led to such incidence but according to political analyst, it was one of the political gimmicks played by both the countries. It was an attempt to achieve success for the upcoming election and somehow they managed to attract what they were seeking. Now looking at the current situation it is difficult to say how tides will turn and how much time it will take for building peace in countries. The only hope is that while keeping aside all political delusions countries should look into their shared cultural histories and create an opportunity for cooperation that could help in achieving some tangible results.

Dzongkha is More Than a Language

By **DORJI WANGCHUK**, BHUTAN

LANGUAGE is not only a medium of communication – in that you don't learn a language just to be able to communicate with someone. Language is a bearer of culture and cultural values, it is a conveyor of feelings and belief systems. And language provides the key to unlock the social world around us. Simply put, if you don't speak the language or speak well, you cannot fully appreciate the intrinsic aspects of society. Your understanding remains shallow at best – and culturally alienated at worst.

Above all, to draw from the famous Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis, language shapes our thoughts. And thoughts eventually dictate our actions. What this means is that the way a native English speaker thinks is different from someone who speaks Italian as mother tongue, who in turn will think differently than the ones who grow up with Dzongkha. In other words, the mind-sets of different native speakers differ – as per this theory.

Therefore, it is quite worrisome that Bhutanese children – our children are deprived of a good grounding in Dzongkha because of the “shortage” of trained Dzongkha teachers in primary schools (Refer Kuensel article, December 25, 2018). This is perhaps the tragedy facing our national language – whereby an issue such this doesn't raise any sense of alarm or uneasiness. I am a native Sharchopkha speaker and I learnt to speak Dzongkha in school. The role of schools in language education, therefore cannot be overstated.

In my current position as a communication scholar, one of the areas that I specialise in is sociolinguistics – a branch of

communication that looks at how language does too, and shapes, a society. My concern, therefore, grows out of a deeper understanding of the role that a national language plays in the process of nation-building and the sense of nationhood.

Our goal of national unity and sovereignty will be severely compromised if the national language is accorded the second-language status – or if Bhutanese people do not speak well enough or take pride – to appreciate the richness of our culture, the importance of the social traditions or the taste for age-old folktales, stories and timeless wisdom. Both nation-building and sovereignty are a work in progress or a dynamic process – or both.

So, what can we do? What are the possible solutions? The following are what comes to my mind. Other social thinkers and commentators may have more or are free to add or diverge from mine.

First, this is not an issue to be left to the Education Ministry or the Dzongkha Development Commission – although these agencies are at the forefront and can do more than what they are doing now. To start with, we need to move beyond the problems, mediocrities or blame-game and get down to some serious business. The issue warrants nothing less than a Parliamentary deliberation and perhaps an Act to protect and promote the national language – if there isn't one already. The Act should, above all, require the Government to pour resources to this area – and not limit to mere tokenism such as requiring Dzongkha on vehicle number-plates or shop signboards. Rather, workable plans,

programs and strategies to strengthen it should be formulated whereby we get to a point where Dzongkha is used widely with pride and pleasure. Only then we will be moving beyond the current state of affairs.

Second, the promotion of the national language could expand to a certification system whereby anyone with the required skills and knowledge could become a certified Dzongkha language teacher. Everyone knows about the TESOL and IELTS certifications. The Dzongkha Development Commission could develop basic, intermediate and advanced Dzongkha Language Teacher's Certification (DLTC) courses, which could be delivered by public and private institutions. Anyone thereafter who is certified can teach Dzongkha in schools or anywhere in the world. Similarly, a basic DLTC certification could be a requirement for certain jobs requiring a public interface.

Such a system could open an industry of its own, which will then go a long way into popularising the language. Private language centres will mushroom and some people might even venture into foreign soils to teach Dzongkha to the Bhutanese diaspora. English, which is one of the most difficult languages with complex syntax, grammar and even pronunciation has become the most popular language in the world – thanks mainly to such aggressive campaigns. It didn't happen just like that – or out of the blues.

Third, systematic research needs to be done in earnest to further develop different pedagogical approaches to teaching Dzongkha. The existing rote-memorization-and-reprimand method may work within the monastic walls but not in a liberal education system. Besides, different native speakers have different ways to comprehend a new language and Dzongkha-teaching should factor these cognitive and linguistic realities.

Fourth, the two agencies that have contributed immensely to popularising Dzongkha (besides the school education system) are the Bhutanese film industry and the Bhutanese Broadcasting Service. Could we

inject more resources and recognition to these two institutions? Could we take a leaf out of the Korean wave, where over US\$ 200 million is injected annually into the K-pop industry by their government? Why don't we push what works instead of lamenting what is not working?

Lastly, Dzongkha should be seen as more than a subject. It should be viewed as an education in itself – by integrating and expanding to other skills and aspects of society such as art, music, history, culture, folktales and values education. Some of these are imparted as extra-curricular already, which is not enough. It is high time we develop further and move them into the mainstream.

In conclusion, let me also point out that in the past any public discourse on the promotion of Dzongkha has been countered with the argument to do it at the expense of English – our current medium of instruction in schools. To me, these arguments are lame excuses or non-starters. The Dzongkha-English debate is not an either-or case. I know many friends and colleagues who are perfect in both. Some are perfect in three or even four languages (Dzongkha, English, Sharchopkha and Bumtap) Swiss people are, for example, three official languages – German, French and Italian and some even in English. Some of the best Dzongkha speakers of my generation are from Mongar, Lhuentse, Bumthang or Trongsa. English is the language that we need to engage with the World – and engagement with the world, at the political level as well as through participation in a globalised economy and travels, is necessary to enhance and sustain our very sovereignty.

The call for protection and promotion of Dzongkha, therefore, should not be equated to cosmetic jingoism or ultra-nationalism but as a genuine concern to retain an important element of national unity, identity and stability. For, Dzongkha is more than a language. It is our national language – one of the binding forces that will ultimately define our destiny as a nation.

courtesy : <http://www.kuenselonline.com>

The NRC Process and the Spectre of Statelessness in India

By **RANABIR SAMADDAR** INDIA

Citizenship and statelessness are inseparable twins. The division between citizens and the stateless is of critical importance in the production of the national space.



AS the game of citizenship acquires a larger hold over the power dynamic, the growth of statelessness in South Asia also becomes more pronounced. Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) president Amit Shah has threatened the nation that each and every ‘infiltrator’ – by which he probably means illegal immigrant (or a person considered

legal for many years now being viewed as illegal) – would be expelled from the country.

At the time the Calcutta Research Group conducted a study on the state of Rohingya in South Asia, we had realised – though somewhat inadequately – that we were scripting a narrative of statelessness

not in neighbouring Myanmar but in our own country. We were reluctant to compare the genesis of the Rohingya question in Myanmar with the current citizenship registration drive in Assam in the wake of preparing a National Register of Citizens (NRC). The exercise rendered a massive number of 'illegal immigrants' – about four million – stateless

While the statelessness of Rohingya is now known, the possibility of statelessness in the Indian northeast through disqualification via NRC is little known outside the country. The final NRC draft, a court-sanctioned process, was published on July 30 this year. The updating process was marred by controversies over what was considered arbitrary verification procedures and the enforcement of extremely rigorous standards for the Bengali speaking population, in particular Bengali-speaking Muslims. Many of them, immigrants from East Pakistan/Bangladesh, had settled there for several decades. Disowned by India and without ties to any other country, a significant number of those excluded from the NRC are thus likely to be rendered stateless.

This has created a precarious situation involving protracted detention of those branded as 'foreigners'. Detention facilities are being expanded for a large number of marginalised and disenfranchised people with no access to effective legal aid and constitutional guarantees. Biometric identification is being energetically pursued to detect 'suspect' foreigners, as was evident in the recent repatriation of a group of Rohingyas and sharing of the data with the Myanmar government. While India has not signed the two key instruments on statelessness – the 1954 UN Convention on the Status of Stateless Persons and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, the NRC process has serious implications in terms of international human right laws.

The idea of comparing the two

contexts to see if there is a pattern in the spread of statelessness in postcolonial regions emerges from the contemporary emphasis on citizenship policies in these countries. Some citizenship markers in many postcolonial countries, including India, are: ethnicity, immigration, shift in emphasis from *jus soli* to *jus sanguinis*, growth of a regional informal labour market characterised by immigrant labour economies, borderland populations and the no-where people, historically structured population flows across postcolonial border formations and boundary delimitations, and finally the desire of rulers to achieve a perfect fit between the 'right' kind of population and the 'right size' of territory. These markers are considered 'necessary' to make a nation-state.

Citizenship and statelessness have never been so linked as they are today. Add to that, protracted displacement leading to statelessness. Once again, South Asia bears witness to such a situation; for instance, consider the case of protracted displacement of the South Bhutanese Nepali-speaking population now in Nepal, or the Chins in northeast India.

The international legal understanding of statelessness, even while taking into account *de facto* statelessness, is inadequate in theorising this growing phenomenon. It may be argued that the Geneva-based wisdom has been dominated by Western experience. We now have several accounts – of the Rohingya or the growing stateless population in the Northeast – to draw attention to a postcolonial perspective of statelessness.

Statelessness in India today also has a broader perspective: The accounts of statelessness of minor, ignored, subjugated histories of discriminated population groups, borders, and informal labour markets across borderlands, and the untold origins of post-colonial citizenship. If the preceding century was a century of partitions, this century may well become

known as the century of stateless people.

THE ELUSIVE SEARCH FOR ORIGINAL DOCUMENTS

The original documents needed to prove citizenship under the NRC are ironically called the 'legacy papers' (related to 1951). The logic is circular, the assumption being that you can claim citizenship only if you have legacy papers. The absence of one document or another, therefore, casts a shadow on the legitimacy of the person's claim. Even if the same documents pertaining to the period from the 1951 NRC to the electoral rolls of March 1971 are re-submitted, they must be investigated to establish 'genuine' citizenship.

In the legal game of citizenship, the onus to prove citizenship is on the residents or the state. Thus, Prateek Hajela, state NRC co-ordinator, blithely says that those who do not find their names in the final draft can approach their respective NRC Seva Kendras (NSK), and get to know the reason/s for exclusion, and obtain an application form to file claims. Those left out can approach the NSK claiming that a proper examination of their documents was not done, and can bring fresh evidence, either documentary or from other members of the family. Yet, for women, it is difficult to catch this lifeline – if it can be considered so – because many of the excluded who are women are primarily married women who had submitted gaon panchayat certificates as a link document to prove their legacy to their original village, and those were rejected. The women have nothing now to corroborate those certificates since the village headmen did not have proper records and registers. Many more in the watery lands of Assam do not have any

record of land holding and residence. The net result is that a huge number of people belonging to four categories – (a) D (doubtful)-voters, (b) descendants of D voters, (c) people whose reference cases are pending at the Foreigners' Tribunals, and (d) descendants of these persons – are kept on 'hold'. The circularity of the logic is clear: if you are a doubtful voter, you are not a citizen, and you are not a citizen because you are a doubtful voter.

Yet, this is not a novel situation. Even when the Indian constitution was being drafted, the search for 'original' documents was an exasperating one. The



Constituent Assembly Secretariat (CAS) was asked how to treat pavement dwellers, vagrants from other areas, and others with no papers of residence or land ownership or settlement certificate. From Assam itself, we only know one side of history, and that is the side of landed proprietors. Their views were documented in the letters of enquiry and desperate messages seeking assurance of protection that reached the CAS. There were letters of enquiry about residents coming from other states and settled elsewhere, as in the Travancore state, or about foreign-returned soldiers – those without proper paperwork. The Assam Citizens' Association, Dhubri, had referred then, as the West Bengal

government despairingly says now, that people had the freedom to reside and settle anywhere in the country and the freedom to hold or dispose of property. At that time, too, papers were not always found in order while states were in actual charge of enrolling citizens, and they demanded 'proofs'. Citizens struggled to get place in the roll (primarily the electoral roll), while not having a place there meant they were not citizens. Typical of such struggles was the efforts by the Assam Citizens' Association, Dhubri, for citizenship and voting rights of the refugees. The genealogy of Article 13 of the Indian constitution still remains hidden from the public eye; a thorough examination of that genealogy is essential to make sense of the game of citizenship today.

A HOUSE FOR CITIZENS?

The division between citizens and the stateless is thus of critical importance in the production of the national space. The national space emerges always as one of two kinds – either that of an inside, which is to say a house for citizens, or an outside, which is to say an anomalous space of outsiders. The game thus either interiorises or exteriorises the national space. This association of interiority with nation, life, security and development permeates not just classical theories of citizenship but our political life as a whole.

As I indicated through some references to the CAS debates, an archaeology of the intimate, that is "we the nation, we the citizens", will require excavating the origins and forms, both real and imaginary, of citizenship. In this historical time of citizenship in post-Independent India, leading up to this moment when biometric details of refugees will be handed over to other governments, we are 'ensuring' our security in the world.

An equally critical division of images of the inside and the outside accompanies the critical division of the national space. The imagination of the Rohingya as a terrorist, or of a landless Muslim peasant living on the chars of Assam as a fundamentalist, or of a Bihari or a Bengali living in Ahmedabad, Mumbai, or Jaipur as a suspect criminal, always seizes the space of the nation, producing this division. This delineates the difference between the interior and the exterior. The deployment of images, as evident from the utterances of a variety of figures ranging from Amit Shah, Tarun Gogoi, Prafulla Mahanta, the current Assam chief minister Sarbananda Sonowal, to a Left-regional nationalist like Hiren Gohain, arises from a revulsion towards an imagination of a mixed life. Thus, doing away with the absolute binary of citizenship and statelessness requires doing away with our dependence on the image of a delineated interior space for its security and growth.

It seems that the East, with Bengal and Bihar, hated, ridiculed and deprecated by the so-called mainstream nation for having no sense of order, discipline, and national loyalty, along with the ideational and political struggles in Assam, will now be at the forefront of this struggle for practising the imagination of 'other spaces' by fighting images of a revanchist space. It is in its trait of creating the image of an anarchic space for all, partly by populist imagination of an 'other space', which will give this part of the nation its symbolic value. Remember, the madman aboard the ship of fools was placed on the inside of an outside as much as he was on the outside of an inside. Bengal, Bihar, and slowly the Northeast – yes, the Northeast – will for quite some years to come be occupying the liminal space.

courtesy : <https://thewire.in/rights/the-spectre-of-statelessness-in-india>

Afghanistan Peace Process

By **SUNIL KUKSAL**, INDIA



AFTER almost 40 years of uninterrupted civil war in Afghanistan, today progress towards a peace process is increasingly seen as central to securing a just and stable future. Ever since the Soviets marched into Afghanistan in 1979, toppling Hafizullah Amin, the people of Afghanistan have not known peace. It seems that history is repeating itself. The international community is once again abandoning war-ravaged Afghanistan at a very crucial point just as it did three decades ago following Soviet withdrawal from the country. The prospect of a negotiated end to the war in Afghanistan involving talks with Taliban currently, faces the challenges posed by competing agendas. Long-time rivals Russia and the United States have backed separate negotiations with different Afghan stakeholders which seems to be muddling the complex process of peace. Taliban held talks with the Americans in Qatar in January 2019 before meeting a delegation of powerful Afghan power brokers in Moscow for “intra-Afghan” talks in February 2019. According to the analysts Russian involvement in the disputed Afghan peace talks indicates its deepening rivalry in an attempt to challenge the U.S. and the peace process backed by it.

INTRA-AFGHAN PEACE TALKS - MOSCOW

Key Afghan power brokers who oppose the current Afghan President Ashraf Ghani held talks with Taliban negotiators in Moscow

on February 5-6, 2019. A delegation of 38 members comprising mainly of former officials, representatives of political parties and current members of Parliament was headed by Mr. Hamid Karzai, the former president of Afghanistan. Taliban delegation was led by their chief negotiator, Sher Mohammad Abbas Stanekzai, who represented the most significant contact between senior Afghan politicians and the Taliban since the United States toppled the hard-line Islamist group from power at the end of 2001. The Moscow-based Council of Afghan Society, an organisation of the Afghan diaspora in Russia, organised the meeting. A range of issues, including a ceasefire, ways to support US Special Envoy Mr. Khalilzad’s initiatives and a path to ensure a “powerful and democratic central government” in Afghanistan were discussed during the meeting. The peace conference in Moscow came some days after peace negotiations between the United States and the Taliban in Qatar. A joint statement issued on behalf of the Afghan delegation described the meeting in Russia as “the first step towards intra-Afghan peace talks” in the peace process.

DOHA TALKS UNDER U.S. PEACE ENVOY ZALMAYKHALILZAD

The United States government under President Donald Trump seems to be inclined, or even desperate, to negotiate a deal with the Taliban. It has been 18 years since US and allied troops first deployed to Afghanistan to overthrow the Taliban and support a democratically elected government. Donald Trump’s administration appointed former US

ambassador Zalmay Khalilzadas special envoy on Afghanistan in September 2018, 17 years after he helped plan the invasion of a country that the US now is increasingly desperate to extricate itself from. Mr. Khalilzad has been given the responsibility to clear the way for talks between Afghanistan President Ashraf Ghani's government and Taliban leaders to come to a reconciliation. U.S. peace envoy Zalmay Khalilzad has held a series of direct talks with Taliban negotiators in the Qatari capital, Doha, from January 21-26, 2019 culminating in the basic framework of a possible peace deal. Although those discussions have not included the Western-backed Kabul government led by Afghan President Ashraf Ghani. The Doha negotiations with Taliban in January 2019 ended with signs of progress towards the withdrawal of thousands of foreign troops from Afghanistan and an end to more than 18 years of war. At the end of their six days of uninterrupted talks in the Qatari capital, Khalilzad and chief Taliban negotiator Stanekzai, in separate statements announced they are close to a deal on a U.S. troop withdrawal from Afghanistan in exchange for assurances from the Taliban they will not allow terrorists to use Afghan soil for future attacks against America and its allies. The US has some 14,000 troops in Afghanistan as part of the NATO-led Resolute Support mission and a separate counterterrorism effort largely directed at groups such as al-Qaeda and the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL or ISIS). Some 8,000 troops from 38 other countries are also involved in Resolute Support. During six days of talks in Qatar, Taliban and U.S. representatives outlined but did not formally agree on a broad plan. The Taliban has yet to make concessions on two key U.S. demands — implementing a cease-fire and agreeing to negotiate directly with Afghan government representatives as part of an Afghan-led, intra-Afghan peace process.

EXCLUSION OF AFGHAN GOVERNMENT

Both processes did not include the

democratically elected Afghan government led by President Ashraf Ghani, which the Taliban has refused to meet. This has been a long-standing Taliban position even before Ghani entered the presidential palace. The Taliban looks at the United States and sees the real power in charge of Afghanistan; it looks at the Afghan government and sees puppets and usurpers doing the bidding of the American occupiers. President Ghani, like many Afghans, wants peace in his country. Mr. Ghani has repeatedly called on the Taliban to begin talks with his government. In February, 2018 he extended an offer to the Taliban granting them formal legitimacy as a political party, prisoner releases, and a constitutional review if the movement entered into peace negotiations with the government, recognized the legitimacy of the government, and respected the rule of law and the rights of women. Analysts say by keeping the Kabul government out of the U.S. - and Russia-backed talks the Taliban wants to "reduce the legitimacy of the Afghan government to a minimum and thus further strengthen its bargaining position vis-a-vis the United States and extract maximum advantage."

The Afghan government has been angered and frustrated that it has been left out of the talks. Ghani planned to convene a consultative Loya Jirga, a traditional assembly of tribal, ethnic, and religious leaders, to reach a national consensus on peace talks with the Taliban. The Afghan government protested against the decision of Taliban to hold talks with U.S. and Pakistani officials in Islamabad on February 18, 2019. Finally, the talks were cancelled after the Afghan government protested to the United Nations Security Council that leaders of the insurgent group were violating travel restrictions under international sanctions. A letter submitted to the United Nations by Nazifullah Salarzai, Afghanistan's deputy representative to the

Continued to page 16

Mr Khan & Minorities

By **PRAFUL GORADIA** INDIA

PAKISTAN's Prime Minister, Imran Khan, has offered to teach India how to treat its minorities. Is it not likely that when he said this, he was experiencing a flashback to his cricketing days, when our fast bowlers were not comparable to his country's pace attack?

Traditionally, in undivided India, it was the Punjab that produced pacemen. The one outstanding name that comes to mind is Mohammad Nissar, the fastest opening bowler that the subcontinent had produced in his day. Certainly, even now, the pack of speed merchants may have something to teach our players.

An Oxonian had once said: "Imran is cricket and cricket is Imran." Similarly, Zubin Mehta is music and cannot be imagined in terms of cricket. So too, it is difficult to reconcile the Imran image with prime ministership.

It is not impossible that while he was talking of minorities, his mind was on how to teach India to play cricket and to play cricket in India at the Eden Gardens. It goes without saying that he has not seen the holocaust of Hindus and Sikhs starting with Rawalpindi in 1947, nor would he know how his Christian compatriots had rejoiced at the birth of Pakistan only to subsequently regret it, plus being frequently accused of blasphemy. The Communist Party had wholeheartedly sponsored Partition, later to beat its breast; it was simply eliminated by the torrent of Islam. As late as 2012-13, 37 murderous attacks against the people of Christ were reportedly perpetrated. The same year saw 16 Hindus and three Sikhs bear the brunt of attacks by

the zealots of the 'peaceful' religion, who of course, are committed to cleaning their land of all impurities.

The Ahmediyas, whose hero Sir Mohammad Zafarullah Khan had drafted the Pakistan Resolution of March 1940, also have their taste of the glory of Pakistan. Imran Khan was certainly not born then to witness the magnificent work done by Sir Zafarullah. Nor perhaps in 1953, when the latter's house in Lahore was set on fire, which induced him to flee Pakistan and not return until his dying days. The rest of the years he spent at The Hague in the Netherlands to bring majesty to the glittering benches of the International Court of Justice. In the meantime, the charismatic Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto expelled the Ahmediyas from the sanctified garden of Islam.

Another Ahmediya hero who brought glory to Imran's country was Dr. Abdul Qadeer Khan, whose thuggish doings in the Netherlands enabled him to obtain the secrets of the atomic bomb, all of course in the cause of Khidmate-Allah, the first Islamic nuclear bomb. He too was rewarded by his faith being expelled.

Well known scholar Farahnaz Ispahani in her book *Purifying the Land of the Pure* (HarperCollins Publishers, India) states the reality of Ahmediyas being the target of Pakistan's rulers. As late as 2012-13, according to her book, 54 lethal attacks against Ahmediyas were carried out. The writer was educated by two men. The first was his grandfather, one of whose friends was Ahmed Ali Jinnah, younger brother of M.A. Jinnah.

He relished Parsi humour and claimed to be culturally a Parsi. Although he was not a practising Muslim, he acquainted his grandfather with his insights into Islam. That when a Muslim wishes to convert someone, it is with the best intention of opening a possible chance of the convert entering jannat. No other god can enable a non-believer to cross the gateway of heaven.

The second gentleman who taught the writer was his spoken Urdu teacher, who did not overtly suggest a conversion but did say that the future lay with Islam.

Just extrapolate the progress of a number of religions. The Yehudis (Jews) have reduced in number and shrunk to a fraction of what they were. The Christians have scattered into many denominations. Many a worshipper in Europe has given up worship.

Christianity's priests have come to Asia, where according to the late Pope John Paul II, there are innumerable souls to harvest. Contrast these performances with the progress of Islam, whose tide is continually rising.

However, this was an enthusiastic opinion; all is not that well in the new Medina. Once the Ahmediyas were expelled from Islam in 1974, it was the turn of the Shias for similar persecution. While they have been the target of the regime's hostility for years, violence against them began rising after the 1970s. During 2012-13 alone, they were subjected to 77 attacks, including suicide terrorist bombings during Shia religious occasions. Not to talk of Shias, the Bareilvi school considered the Deobandis and Wahhabis outside the pole of Islam and were liable to the death penalty if they fell within the definition of murtad or apostate. On the other hand, the Justice Munir equality report of 1954 had revealed that a fatwa of the Deobandis had called all Asna-Ashari Shias kafirs and murtaad for believing in the sahabiyyat of Hazrat Siddiqi-Akbar and Qazif or deniers of the status of Hazrat Aisha Siddiqa.

In its 2013 annual report, the United States Commission on International Religious

Freedom (USCIRF) described Pakistan's failure to protect its minorities as having reached 'crisis proportions'. According to the report, "The government of Pakistan continues to engage in and tolerate systematic, ongoing, and egregious violations of freedom of religion or belief." Violations reached unprecedented levels, it said, because of growing incidents of sectarian violence against Shia Muslims." The government also failed to protect Christians, Ahmadis and Hindus, it said.

Pakistan's blasphemy laws have exacerbated attacks on minorities by fostering religious frenzy, violence and persecution.

Police frequently fail to record and investigate complaints, and justice is impeded by the biased attitude of some judges against religious minorities. Pakistan's national discourse, aided by its school curriculum, generates religious prejudice against minorities.

In Pakistan, there are Lashkars who are anti-Shia, but the single-minded enemy of the Shias is the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ) whose avowed objective is to cleanse Pakistan of them, who, incidentally comprise about 20 per cent of the country's population. Balochistan, which has many Shias, is a popular theatre of genocide. The head of the LeJ has gone to the extent of issuing a public letter declaring the Shias to be wajib-ul-qatl (ideally suitable for elimination). Despite this large-scale genocide, Pakistan's government has admitted that only 2,000 Shias were killed over a five-year period. The Shia-Sunni conflict has a dimension much bigger and beyond the borders of Pakistan.

Sunni Saudi Arabia and Shiite Iran are arraigned against each other. Iraq comprises two-thirds Shias, while the civil war in Syria was fought between the Shia sympathetic government and the Caliphate-aspiring ISIS.

However, the concern for India, are the 25 million Shias in our neighbouring country. If the terrorism becomes collectively unbearable, where do they seek refuge?

Courtesy : <https://www.thestatesman.com>

Let's Not Dance to The Tune of Hindu Martial Music

By **S A AIYAR**, INDIA

MUSIC should respect no borders of nation, region, religion or language. It should soar across the world and captivate all humanity. I am aghast that a Delhi concert, sponsored by Spic Macay and the Airports Authority of India (AAI), had to be “postponed” after Hindu fanatics warned against the participation of Carnatic music maestro T M Krishna.

His sin is that he has often included Christian and Muslim themes in his music. That is actually the sort of inclusiveness that has always marked Indian music, and indeed all Indian culture. Alas, the fanatics had so much clout with the ruling BJP that the sponsors had to back down. This was cultural barbarism.

Jawaharlal Nehru would have been outraged by such barbarism. But no outrage flowed from Rahul Gandhi and his gutless Congress cohorts, who have abandoned Nehruvian secularism for a soft Hindutva that smells like the leftovers of a BJP meal. Fortunately, the Aam Aadmi Party, which rules Delhi state, came to the rescue by providing an alternative concert platform for Krishna.

Hindu fanatics have cowed many artists. But not Krishna. He says, “The troll army has the underlying patronage of people in power. I have been trolled for a long time for my social position, my perspectives on politics, and my disagreements with the BJP regime. I believe in every art form. Allah, Jesus and Ram make no difference. It is a multilingual

and multi-religious country.” Bravo!

After the latest ruckus, he tweeted, “Considering the vile comments and threats issued by many on social media regarding Carnatic compositions on Jesus, I announce here that I will be releasing one Carnatic song every month on Jesus or Allah.” All musicians and artists need to applaud this stance, in contrast to the pathetic BJP whitewash attempted by dancer Sonal Mansingh (who, not entirely coincidentally, was earlier nominated to the Rajya Sabha by the BJP government).

Hindustani music has many glorious roots, many sources of inspiration. The sitar is a modern version of the Persian setar (a three-stringed instrument), the sarod originated in the Afghan rubab, and the harmonium came from the European accordion. That does not make them Muslim or Christian or foreign. They are part and parcel of Hindustani music. Bismillah Khan and Amjad Ali Khan are as essential to Hindustani music as Ravi Shankar or Hari Prasad Chaurasia: their religions are irrelevant.

North Indians may not be aware of the remarkable absorptive capacity of southern Carnatic music. Classical music is often viewed as traditional and resistant to change. But the violin, introduced during the British Raj, has become so integral to Carnatic music that its followers would be outraged at the suggestion that it is alien.

Far from objecting, South Indian

audiences cheered when Uppalapu Srinivas began using the mandolin to play Carnatic music. Indeed, he attained fame with the nickname Mandolin Srinivas. Today, Kadri Gopalnath is the foremost exponent of Carnatic music on the saxophone. Unlike Hindutva barbarians, these musicians know that music and musical instruments have no borders.

The bhajan may be called Hindu religious music. But Muslims have sung many of the greatest bhajans. Mohammed Rafi was among the greatest bhajan singers of all time. Probably the most famous bhajan in film history is O Duniya ke Rakhwale from Baiju Bawra. The music was composed by Naushad Ali, the lyrics were penned by Shakeel Badayuni and the song sung by Rafi. These three Muslims created a bhajan dearly beloved by Hindus, because music knows no boundaries.

My favourite bhajan of the 1950s is Insaaf ka Mandir Hai, from the film Amar.

Here again, the music was by Naushad, the lyrics by Shakeel Badayuni and the singing by Rafi. In addition, the film was produced by Mehboob Khan, and its three main actors were all Muslims — Dilip Kumar (aka Yusuf Khan), Madhubala (aka Mumtaz Jehan Dehlavi) and Nimmi (aka Nawab Banoo). Did this detract in the slightest from the quality of the bhajan? No, it was a triumphant demonstration that music conquers all barriers.

The barbarians want us all to dance to the tune of Hindu martial music. Well, the most nationalistic musical event featuring the armed forces bands is the Beating Retreat ceremony every year on January 29 at Vijay Chowk in New Delhi. Every year, the bands play Sare Jahan se Achha, penned by Iqbal. They also play Abide with Me, which was Gandhiji's favourite Christian hymn. The message is clear: patriotism and music should have nothing to do with religion.

courtesy : <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/blogs/>

Swaminomics/

Continued from page 12

Afghanistan Peace Process

body, said the Taliban's trip to Pakistan and particularly the meeting with Mr. Imran Khan would amount to "the official recognition and legitimization of an armed group that poses a serious threat to the security and stability of Afghanistan and whose members are sanctioned by provisions of the U.N. Security Council."

THE WAY AHEAD

Critics say only talking to the Taliban will not serve many purposes. For attaining long term stability and peace, the Afghan peace process has to be comprehensive and should include the participation of Afghans from all walks of life including political parties, civil society, the central government, and tribal chiefs. A hasty American withdrawal will

jeopardize for Afghans the future of hard-won gains such as constitutional rights, freedoms of citizens and democratic institutions. The exit strategy must also be aligned with Afghanistan's development priorities in infrastructure, agriculture, extractive industries, and private sector and human capital development, to help generate greater revenue and create long-term jobs. To arrive at a sustainable peace, the withdrawal of forces, the negotiation process and the implementation of any potential agreement must be monitored by a neutral third-party observer, such as the United Nations or European Union, which can establish an enforcement mechanism that can ensure all parties deliver on their commitments.

Transcending Boundaries Through Art

By **PROMA CHAKRABORTY**, INDIA

Eight South Asian artists got together in Kathmandu to create artwork on personal encounters, myths and fables, now exhibited in Delhi.

POLITICAL conflicts, religious tension, socio-economic disputes—the world is no stranger to these frictions when it comes to the relationship of countries sharing borders in South Asia. The constant struggle between conflict and cooperation has managed to make the lines between the countries, firm if not stronger. Pushing past these boundaries in an attempt to blur the lines of conflict is not some grand strategy or scheme that comes to play, but the creative tool of art.

Putting together the work of eight contemporary artists from India, Pakistan, Bangladesh and Nepal, an exhibition in Delhi is dissolving the boundaries. These artists explore themes of immediate concern to them: the responsibility of power, memory and history, and the use and enjoyment of the same in common spaces. Two artists from each of the four countries came together at a residential



programme held at Kathmandu in the summer of 2018 to create their works.

"Nepal being a visa-free zone was the perfect location for the artists," says Bhavna Kakkar, curator of the exhibition. "Although we are neighbours, there are several visa hassles. There are these geographical hurdles that one has to keep in mind. Also, the artists wanted to utilise the local craftsmanship of the country."

To voice their concerns, the artists collaborated with the traditional Paubha artists of Nepal. The Paubha paintings blend seamlessly with myriad etchings, pencil drawings, watercolours and prints and eventually accentuate each of these artworks. The detailed subtlety and delicacy of the Paubha traditional motifs were employed to arrive at the final work, serving as an impactful medium to convey the concerns and emotion of the artists.

"As a traditional art form that is still very much in practice, Paubha blends modernity as well as tradition," explains Bhavna.

Evolving over years of discussion, these eight artists decided to merge and create an entire set of paintings representing the varying techniques of contemporary art forms and the traditions of Paubha art. This culminated in the exhibition titled "Nowthere". "The title is symbolic of the transient state of this country. It suggests time as well as space. It refers to today and tomorrow as well as 'here' and 'there', that is, the next-door country," says Bhavna.

From multiple layers of personal encounters, myths and fables, intrinsic self-observation, to emulation of important personalities—all of these come together to form an interesting set of artworks in the exhibition which bridges the gap between time, space, geography and personal identities. For instance, the work of Waseem Ahmed, an artist based in Lahore, brings the essence of the whole project together. The series, titled "Myth and Realities", features gods and goddesses from Hindu, Roman and Greek culture, as well as significant religious figures like Gautam Buddha. Using mythology and images from the past, he narrates a story of the present times. The sculptures of war heroes, mythological gods of past times tend to narrate how the socio-political events of today are similar. "My work explores the connection of all the countries beyond the invisible borders

through mythology. The violence in these stories is a part of our reality now," says Waseem.



D r a w i n g inspiration from Indian mythology, artist Seema Kohli features a female protagonist who is no longer fettered by the chains of either body or mind. It is about yoginis and dakinis and their feminine energy and various manifestations. She uses 24-carat gold leaf on paper to create mesmerising art and explores the shared history and

tradition of these countries.

Another artist who makes use of these gold leaf sketches on paper is Mahbubur Rahman of Bangladesh. He draws his inspiration from iconic leaders of the world, particularly the South Asian arena. His work features the likes of Mahatma Gandhi, Jawaharlal Nehru, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, George W Bush, Kim Jong-un and others, all sketches evocative of Paubha art.

Moving to more contemporary and recent events, artists Maria Waseem and M Pravat's creations are based on the 2015 earthquake in Nepal. Based in India, M Pravat confesses that he had no knowledge about Paubha artists before embarking on this project but upon researching on the Internet and speaking to Nepali locals, he discovered that they relied heavily on the traditionally revered motifs of the five elements of air, water, earth, sky and ether, and believed it was their faith in Lord Bhairon which helped them survive the earthquake. This unfettered resonance with their religion and its spiritual influence on their lives and livelihoods drew Pravat to their work, as he believes it to be

one of the most important connections of the four countries.

"This aspect of faith is highly emphasised in South Asian countries especially when compared to other European countries," Pravat explains. His works are marked by a fine blend of practical understanding and faith. Having digitally photographed architectural images for several years, he chose to depict the destroyed architectural structures from the earthquake, embedding them with the transparent pigment of Paubha art. Similarly, Maria Waseem deftly captures both the old and new parts of the landscape—the juxtaposition of Paubha technique augments them with a metaphoric blend of traditional art with modern photography techniques.

Apart from exploring the connection of faith, another artist explores the notion of cultural attachment. The works of Nepal's Sauraganga Darshandhari is laden with details that are particular to the culture of her country. "Attachment to our culture is very prevalent among our countries. Be it architecture of our homes and temples to everyday rituals, the attachment to these are very strongly present in these four

countries." Her sketching features women in their traditional costumes and shows a high influence of nature.

Connecting to these ethnic roots, Prithvi Shreshtha, also from Nepal, uses a process of introspection and intrinsic shadow play. His watercolour works are a result of his reactions to the people of South Asia as well his own shadow.

Shedding light on the issues of violence against women—which is relevant to all four countries—Bangladeshi artist Begum Tayeba Lipi uses a veil or the metallic mask as a metaphor to portray the subjugation of women. Through her pencil and gold and silver leaf creations on paper, she articulates the issue of subjugation of women, suppression and misogyny in her country.

While newsfeeds of cross-border terrorism and tensions regularly pop up on our screens, it is perhaps projects like Nowhere which are proving to be the proverbial bridges between the countries. The exhibition was on display at Gallery Latitude 28 in New Delhi till February 28.

courtesy : <http://thepatriot.in/2019/01/24/transcending-boundaries/>



The Psyche and Phantasy

By **CHRISTOPHER CAUDWELL**



...Continued from previous issue

NO satisfactory classification of mentation has yet been proposed. We are concerned with the flow of images (not necessarily visual) to which I give the name phantasy, to distinguish them from clear perception or memory. We will use the following classification of these: (a) Dream; (b) Day-Dream or Reverie; (c) Free Association; (d) Directed Thinking; (e) Directed Feeling.

Until the psycho-analysts, no psychologist seriously studied the dream. Thanks to Freud, we now see the absurdity of that omission. Because of its primitive character and strange features, the dream throws light on the nature of phantasy and the rôle of thought.

The dream has certain characteristics which distinguish it from other kinds of thought. By far the most important is the fact that in it thoughts – the memory-images of percepts condensed, displaced and modified – take the place of the real environment. This is the specific feature of dream. In all other forms of phantasy the thinker is still vaguely conscious of his environment and does not sit himself in the products of his fancy; he does not give them the status of immediate surroundings. The dreamer does. Hence they acquire a vividness and rounded actuality such as always belongs to the immediate environment when it is the object of attention.

This “materialising” of thoughts is the result of introversion, of a withdrawing of

sensory attention from the environment. This introversion is what constitutes sleep. Sufferers from anaesthesia of the skin have only to close their eyes – providing the room is quiet – to fall into slumber. All the aids to sleep— darkness, quiet, mental blankness – are devices for reducing external sensory stimuli.

The materiality and vividness of dream-thoughts are thus only relative. If one recalls dream faces, forms, words and scenes, they are all vague, blurred, colourless, full of holes, indefinite and incomplete. But because no external sensory reality existed to quarrel with them, they assumed the status and vividness of the environment. It is this concentration of attention which gives the dream material its reality and vividness and not its own internal coherence. On the contrary, the material of dream is confused and patchy.

Jung investigated ordinary “free association” – waking associations of one image to another formed by the mind freely, without conscious attention to reality. Dream is an elaborate form of continuous free association, in which the free flow of phantasy acquires the material reality of an environment. Freud laid bare the mechanism of this more elaborate free association of dream.

Surréalisme bases its technique on this free association. It hopes thus to realise a spontaneous artistic production. Here it only displays the classic bourgeois illusion that freedom is the ignorance of necessity. Freud’s and Jung’s experiments have clearly

proved that so far from dream or free association really being free, they are subject to the iron determinism of unconscious necessity. Distortions of instinctive drives called complexes inexorably force phantasy to follow a mean and narrow groove.

MacCurdy's researches on the productions of maniacs revealed the same iron law hidden beneath apparent spontaneity. The seemingly effortless and bewilderingly profuse flow of manic raving proved, on the careful analysis of stenographic reports over a long period, to be in fact all determined by some wish of an infantile simplicity. Once the unconscious law was revealed, the raving was seen to be simply a few thoughts which oscillated within the bounds of the crudest symbols.

What is the function of dream? Freud and Rivers agree that it is physiologically "the guardian of sleep." Stimuli that might rouse the sleeper to action – that is, wake him – are switched into non-motor channels unless they become imperative. Such stimuli include not merely external stimuli, such as bells whose sound is woven into the dream, but also internal stimuli – pains, hunger, sexual wishes, all the nascent stirrings of instinctive desire which make even a dog execute running movements in his sleep.

Freud also saw that this explanation by no means ended the matter. Granted that dreams enable one to sleep on in spite of disturbing stimuli, why do they take the particular form they do? Freud showed that they must take the form of a phantastic response to the external stimuli. It is a pity he gave this general quality of dreams the particular description of "wish-fulfilment," as it has misled his followers and has tended to separate psycho-analysis from other fields of psychology, such as behaviourism and gestalt psychology.

Suppose a sleeper has been called. The knock penetrates his dream; the active response to this would normally take the form of his getting up. His phantastic response therefore takes the form of

dreaming that he gets up – an experience most of us have had. In the same way, if a sleeper is disturbed by hunger pangs, his waking response would be to feed, and therefore starving explorers dream perpetually of food.

Of course this is "wish-fulfilment," inasmuch as in phantasy one fulfils one's wish to get up or to feed. But wish-fulfilment is misleading as a general description, because "wish" is a term usually used of a consciously formulated aim, and its use here hides the close kinship of the phantastic response of dream to the active response of waking life. All the countless stimuli that move us in daily life to action – a command, an incentive, something seen, curiosity, a memorandum, a letter, a burning sexual desire – may be called wishes, since plainly we would perform no action unless we had some instinctive dynamism inside us to make us do so. But to use the term "wish-fulfilment" of such actions, or of their phantastic equivalent in dream, gives them a queer and freakish appearance and leads Freud into difficulties to explain "unpleasant" dreams and "unsatisfying" dreams. It is a reflection of his idealist subjective approach to the subject-object relations of concrete life.

Dreams are conscious. Now we have already seen that the data of consciousness are socially given, that man by language, education and social contacts finds his instinctive responses conditioned by the common world and the common ego and given the status of consciousness. Therefore society is still with man in dream. Even in dream the social ego phantastically fulfils man's desires in the social world.

In the social world man may get up or eat in immediate response to the appropriate stimuli. But the conditions of association demand that an instinctive desire to strike a certain man or kiss a certain woman be not gratified. In the social world therefore such illegal desire can meet with one of two alternative fates, to which Freud has given

the names of "repression" and "sublimation."

If we "repress" the desire, we dismiss it from the conscious field by an effort of will. Now we already saw that consciousness corresponded to the "socialisation" or adaptation to civilisation of instinctive responses. Consequently a desire that has a conscious dress already has its barbaric nudity clothed; it is already half-civilised. If such a desire is so strong that it is not dismissed by other interests (i.e. other instinctive drives) but requires to be forcibly repressed into the unconscious by an act of will, then it is plain that this very repression strips the wish of its veneer of education and makes it barbaric and savage. Hence the evils of repression, which Freud's school has pointed out, are due to the very act which strips them of their social adaptation and makes them savage prisoners. From this barbarising of conscious wishes springs the terrible ferocity of the saint, the bitterness of the puritan and the unspeakable cruelties of a Holy Inquisition.

In sublimation the instincts are given a social adaptation which permits them to satisfy themselves in consciousness. To write a "strong" letter, to indulge in violent sport or economic competition, are ways in which society permits us to give our instinctive wish a conscious dress. To wrestle with nature, to give our hate a creative material outlet, are still higher forms of sublimation. To dance, to write love poetry, to pay the woman we love the compliments of service or speech are the ways in which we civilise our sex. Thus these instincts, whose blind strength might make us their blind slaves, acknowledge us as their masters and increase our spontaneity, because they are given a conscious and therefore social adaptation. Here too freedom is seen to be the consciousness of necessity.

But the range of possibility of sublimation, the width of consciousness and therefore of spontaneity, is not settled in the ideal world. It is part of the social product and like all the freedom of society is

generated by labour. In the past the majority of consciousness and therefore the greatest range of sublimation has gone to the class which has appropriated the major share of the social product; and for the other class, the sublimation of its socially-thwarted desires for leisure and food have taken the crude form of religion and the phantastic structure of a dream paradise.

The "I" of dream is still the socialised "I," the instinctive, unconscious, genotypical ego modified by contact with the common ego. The world of dream is still the world of instinctive response to environment modified by the common perceptual world. It is for this reason that as in real life so in dream the hunger and getting-up urges are gratified by direct phantasy – we dream of eating or dressing – whereas instincts to kill or rape other human beings are sublimated or, as Freud puts it, "distorted by the censor." Of course as instincts they are neither to kill nor to rape – since killing and raping are social conceptions, unknown to the unconscious instincts of sex and self-preservation. However, these words must be used in discussing the unconscious in the terms of the conscious.

The idea of a separate endo-psychic censor is obviously an abstraction. In fact this censor and the distortion "he" produces are not the work of a special department of the psyche but are given in the nature of consciousness itself. Any neural "engram" whose activity forms a part of a dream consciousness must necessarily respect certain social laws, because that very consciousness is like a suit of clothes and a shave – a sign that it has been civilised.

Why in that case do we in dream permit ourselves to do things we should be ashamed to do in real life? Two factors combine to produce this moral looseness of dream. It has already been remarked that the genotype is born not merely a savage but a brute, and hence the development of consciousness is a shaping of the outside, a carving of the intact trunk. Consciousness

begins as self-consciousness, as a detachment of the self from the environment, but this alone does not secure consciousness; it is in a sense opposed to it and merely instinctive. It is only when self-consciousness returns on the environment and by experience impresses the environment on itself that it becomes conscious of reality, of "otherness." This is a social process. The baby grows conscious by becoming interested in its surroundings and learning about them by active experience. Because it does so by means of language and social activity, its experience of reality is an experience of the rich complex reality of the common perceptual world. In the introversion of sleep the environment sinks away and with it therefore vanishes much of the social world of reality. We tend to return to the introversion of childhood and the dawning self-consciousness of infancy, in which the "I" is everything and external reality as yet a vague chaos. This explains not merely the archaic and infantile character of dreams, but also the extent to which their analysis reveals the influence of infantile experience. When we sleep the face grows childish. For the same reason in dream the Mother, the return to the womb, incest, and all the other familiar infantile Freudian motives play an important part. The "I" of dream, though so important, is a petty ego, for social life is the means of its realisation. The "I" of dream is like the world of dream, only partly socialised. Thus dream is doubly detached from reality – external and internal. It is not completely severed on either side but it is loosened.

It would be wrong to deduce from dream to life without allowing for the difference. This difference is the more active rôle in life of the environment which in its consciously perceived form is a social construct. We are born a genotype – merely instinctive. We become self-conscious and, by interaction with the environment, receive an adaptation of the instincts which determines our infantile consciousness and our infantile hopes, aspirations and aims.

Our growth to manhood is accompanied by an enrichment of consciousness – that is, by a still more far-reaching adaptation of our childish desires to the environment. Our adult consciousness is not determined by our infantile, any more than our infantile consciousness is determined by our instinctive genotype. There is a difference which consists in the difference in experience, and this experience rests on a deeper penetration of the environment as a result of living in society. We have lived and therefore are altered. Freudism, by taking the dream at its own valuation, constantly dismisses the adaptations of consciousness as fetters or inhibitions on the instincts, without seeing the vital fact that these adaptations are generated by the struggle of the instincts with the environment. Robbed of these adaptations the instincts would be so much the less free. To strip the tortoise or the crab of its shell would not free it but would expose it to the necessity of the environment. This does not of course exclude the possibility of these adaptations becoming relatively cramping – relative to the freedom of other adaptations already made possible by a change in the material conditions. For example, the horny integument of the cactus secures its free development in desert regions, but if it should grow moist, this integument would cramp its development and the skin would either be discarded or the cactus would be crowded out by more thin-fleshed plants. This applies still more powerfully to man whose social organisation secures a continuous and rapid change in his productive forces.

Thus the loose character of the dream is partly explained by its infantilism. Our social conditioning is closely associated with the environment, for reasons already explained. Any weakening in environmental strength tends to lessen our adaptation. We all know how we act differently away from the home circle, or with friends, or in a foreign country. We know that the instinctive outburst of rage or the non-social

behaviour of drunkenness are accompanied by a weakening of the reality of the environment; "we forgot where we were." In sleep introversion robs the environment of absolute reality; hence a corresponding loosening of social coherence, which, however, cannot vanish as long as the dream remains conscious; yet conscious it must be to have value, for the instincts, owing to their long conditioning, cannot act except upon socially accepted reality, and all such reality is conscious.

Because of its archaic and instinctive nature, the reality which makes up the conscious material of dream is crude and limited as compared with the reality of waking consciousness. This applies not merely to the external reality which figures in a dream as "dream thoughts," but to internal reality, the "I" which experiences them. It is a mean, petty and selfish "I." We are not conscious of any nobility or heroic quality in this "I"; on the contrary, it never does anything we can really be proud of. Even its achievements are gained too easily. After waking from dream we are only too glad we are not "really like that." And in fact we are not, for it is the process of association which makes men noble and heroic which gives their character more beauty and worth. Hence the "I" of dream, stripped of so much of its social adaptation, is stripped of its largeness and human value.

Yet we see phantasy even in the form of dream reaching out towards an ameliorative role. In dream the ego experiments in action upon reality, but it is now a plastic reality without the stiffness of

material things. In the space of a night it is possible to combine and recombine, free from the immediate tension of a direct contact with reality and the limitations of manipulating real stuff.

It is possible to experiment with new forms of reality more appropriate to our instincts and to experience in a provisional way what these forms would feel like and how our instincts would react to their achievement. Thus the illusion of dream has this biological value, that by experimenting ideally with possible realities and attitudes towards them it paves the way for such changes in reality. Dream prepares the way for action; man must first dream the possible before he can do it. It is true that the realisation of our dream is never the same as the dream; it looks different and it feels different. Yet it also has something in common with our desire, and its realisation was only possible because dream went before and lured us on, as the harvest festival made possible the harvest. Of course dream is too archaic and too phantastically isolated from social reality to be of much value in the concrete living of civilised man.

The "remedy" for the illusory character of dream is not to abolish dream but to so enlarge and extend it that it becomes increasingly close to the realisation it is made to anticipate; to fill it more full of life and reality and vivid content. Once again freedom is extended by an extension of the consciousness of necessity. This programme calls for the socialisation of dream.

to be continued...

Courtesy—Illusion and Reality

Your support and contribution will help ISD spread its message of Peace.
For queries regarding donation and support write to us at notowar.isd@gmail.com

Your stories are valuable to us. Share them so that others can also read.
Mail us at notowar.isd@gmail.com

INSTITUTE *for* SOCIAL DEMOCRACY, New Delhi, India
E-MAIL : notowar.isd@gmail.com / WEBSITE www.sach.org.in / www.isd.net.in